Item 7.D.



CITY OF ORLAND Staff Report

TO: City of Orland Planning Commission

FROM: Scott Friend, AICP – City Planner

MEETING DATE: February 17, 2022; 5:30 p.m. Carnegie Center, 912 Third Street, Orland, CA 95963

SUBJECT: Zoning Code Amendment: Adoption of Objective Design Standards

California State Senate Bill 35 (Government Code Section 65913.4), which went into effect on January 1, 2018, was part of a comprehensive bill package aimed at addressing the State's housing shortage and high costs. SB 35 requires the availability of a streamlined ministerial approval process for qualifying multifamily residential developments. As a part of this, bill cities and counties are required to establish objective design standards for qualifying multifamily residential development.

Environmental Review: Staff recommends that the Planning Commission determine that the proposed action is *exempt* from further CEQA review pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3), the *common sense rule* as the action will not include any physical development nor result in development which is not already considered in the particular zoning district.

Previous Planning Commission Action:

The Objective Design Standards were brought before the Planning Commission at a duly noticed Planning Commission hearing on December 16, 2021. At that time, the Commission decided to continue this action to a later meeting in order to allow for additional Planning commission review. This item is being brought back to the Planning Commission for action as a noticed Public Hearing. A new public hearing notice was prepared and published for this action.

Background:

California State Senate Bill 35 (Government Code Section 65913.4), which went into effect on January 1, 2018, was part of a comprehensive bill package aimed at addressing the State's housing shortage and high costs. SB 35 requires the availability of a streamlined ministerial approval process for multifamily residential developments, defined as a housing development that contains two or more residential units and is restricted to lower or moderate income households, in jurisdictions that have not yet made sufficient progress toward meeting their regional housing need allocation (RHNA). Those jurisdictions that have not met their RHNA are defined by the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD), which oversees this determination, as those cities and counties who have not met the RHNA, by income category, for a reporting period.

Objective Design Standards City of Orland Planning Commission Meeting – February 17, 2022 P a g e | 2

Included as a part of SB 35 streamlining requirements, cities are required to establish objective design standards for multifamily residential development that are eligible under SB 35. SB 35 defines an objective design standard as one that involves "no personal or subjective judgment by a public official and is uniformly verifiable by reference to an external and uniform benchmark or criterion available and knowable by both the development applicant... and the public official prior to submittal." As a result, the City is required to develop and include in the Orland Municipal Code objective design standards. The draft Objective Design Standards ordinance, which is a new chapter (17.18) of the Municipal Code, is included as Attachment A – Objective Design Standards.

While not the subject of this staff report, information on SB 35 35 eligible projects is provided below as additional background material. SB 35 eligible projects have a number of state requirements for location and affordability, generally these include:

Location

1. The site has to be a legal parcel or parcels located in a city if, and only if, the city boundaries include some portion of either an urbanized area or urban cluster.

2. At least 75 percent of the perimeter of the site adjoins parcels that are developed with urban uses. For the purposes of this section, parcels that are only separated by a street or highway shall be considered to be adjoined.

3. It is zoned for residential use or residential mixed-use development or has a general plan designation that allows residential use or a mix of residential and nonresidential uses, and at least two-thirds of the square footage of the development is designated for residential use.

Affordability

- 1. The development proponent has committed to record, a land use restriction or covenant providing that all lower or moderate income housing units remain available at affordable housing costs or rent for no less than the following periods of time:
 - a. Fifty-five years for units that are rented.
 - b. Forty-five years for units that are owned.
- 2. The development is subject to a requirement mandating a minimum percentage of below market rate housing based on one of the following:
 - a. The City's latest Housing Element annual report reflects that there were fewer units of above moderate-income housing issued building permits than were required for the RHNA cycle and the project contains more than 10 units of housing, the project does the following:

- i. The project dedicates a minimum of 10 percent of the total number of units to housing affordable to households making at or below 80 percent of the area median income.
- b. The City's latest Housing Element annual report reflects that there were fewer units of housing issued building permits affordable to either very low income or low-income households by income category than were required for the RHNA cycle and the project seeking approval dedicates 50 percent of the total number of units to housing affordable to households making at or below 80 percent of the area median income.

Discussion:

The subject of this staff report is the required Objective Design Standards as prescribed by SB 35. As defined in Gov. Code Section 65913.4(a)(5):

.... For purposes of this paragraph, "objective zoning standards," "objective subdivision standards," and "objective design review standards" mean standards that involve no personal or subjective judgment by a public official and are uniformly verifiable by reference to an external and uniform benchmark or criterion available and knowable by both the development applicant or proponent and the public official before submittal.....

Design vs. Development Standards

In the planning and development realm, there is an important distinction between development standards and design standards. While each inevitably play a large role in the overall look and feel of a structure, they have historically been treated and enforced differently.

Development Standards

Development standards are regulations pertaining to the physical modification of a structure or development, including the size and location of structures in relation to the lot. Development standards include maximum height of structures, minimum lot area, minimum setbacks, maximum lot coverage. By nature, these standards are objective because they establish standards that are verifiable by reference to known criteria (e.g., minimum lot size: 6,000 square feet, maximum height: 35 feet, etc.). In Orland, development standards are primarily established in the Zoning Ordinance.

Design Standards and Guidelines

Design standards and guidelines provide design guidance for City staff and applicants. Used in conjunction with the Zoning Ordinance and applicable development standards, design standards/guidelines provide a common basis for the evaluation of design during the project approval process. Typically, design standards incorporate objective language in the form of mandates whereas design guidelines are often subjective and make design recommendations.

Objective Design Standards City of Orland Planning Commission Meeting – February 17, 2022 P a g e | 4

Where the word "shall" or "must" is used it is intended to be a mandate; and where the word "should" or "encouraged" is used, it is intended to be a recommended guideline. The mandates are treated as standards with little room for variation whereas the recommendations are subject to some interpretation and have room for minor deviations.

While the City has very few design requirements, design guidelines and standards can regulate a multitude of design features and provide some control over building design in the City for those projects that are ministerial, requiring no discretionary approval, in process. These features include lighting, articulation, building materials, color, fenestration, roof design, and building massing. SB 35 eligible projects would be, as required by SB 35, ministerial in process and would not be subject to any design review approval by the Planning Commission of City Council. As such, the adoption of Objective Design Standards is an important factor in assuring that future multifamily development meets the City's objectives for design and compatibility.

The Objective Design Standards follows the City's current site and design standards as identified in the Municipal Code. However, the Objective Design Standards expands these requirements in order to assure an adequately designed and aesthetically pleasing multifamily complex in response to SB 35's elimination of discretionary design review for any qualified multifamily development requesting streamlined ministerial approval. The Objective Design Standards provides for site requirements including:

- street connectivity,
- the amount of parking,
- parking location, design, and access,
- parking lot lighting,

- onsite outdoor recreation areas,
- landscaping,
- fencing, and
- refuse containers.

The Objective Design Standards also provides requirements for building design including:

- building mass and articulation,
- façade transparency/limitation on blank walls,
- exterior theme, andscreening of mechanical

electrical equipment.

and

• roofline,

Environmental determination:

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission determine that the proposed Municipal Code Amendment(s) to be categorically exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3) as it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the proposed revisions to the City of Orland Municipal Code would have a significant effect on the environment, and therefore the proposed revision is not subject to CEQA. A Notice of Exemption was prepared for this project and has been included with this staff report as **Attachment B** -**Notice of Exemption**.

Objective Design Standards City of Orland Planning Commission Meeting – February 17, 2022 P a g e | 5

Recommendation:

Staff requests that the Planning Commission consider the proposed revisions to the Municipal Code and recommend changes, if necessary. If no changes are considered necessary, staff recommends that the Planning Commission recommend for approval to the City Council, the Amendment(s) to the Orland Municipal Code, as contained herein, through adoption of Planning Commission Resolution #2022-XX (Attachment C). Staff also recommends that the Planning Commission recommend for approval to the City Council, adoption of the Notice of Exemption (Attachment C) prepared for the proposed action.

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission utilize the following process for consideration of this matter:

- 1. Accept a presentation of the project by staff;
- 2. Open the public hearing and take public testimony;
- 3. Close the public hearing and initiate consideration of the project by the Planning Commission; and
- 4. Motion and vote by the Planning Commission.

If the Planning Commission determines that it intends to recommend for approval the Municipal Code Amendment, staff presents the following motions for consideration:

I move that the Planning Commission adopt Planning Commission Resolution #2022-XX recommending for approval to the City Council, the Municipal Code Amendment as presented herein and approval of the Categorical Exemption as presented.

ATTACHMENTS

- Attachment A Municipal Code Amendment Chapter 17.18 Objective Design Standards
- Attachment B Notice of Exemption
- Attachment C Planning Commission Resolution 2022-XX

CHAPTER 17.18 – OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS

Sections:

17.18.010 – Purpose.

California State Senate Bill 35 (Government Code Section 65913.4), which went into effect on January 1, 2018, requires the availability of a streamlined ministerial approval process for multifamily residential developments in jurisdictions that have not yet made sufficient progress toward meeting their regional housing need allocation (RHNA) as determined by the California Department of Housing and Community Development.

Included in the streamlining process, cities are required to establish objective design standards for multifamily residential development. SB 35 defines an objective design standard as one that involves "no personal or subjective judgment by a public official and is uniformly verifiable by reference to an external and uniform benchmark or criterion available and knowable by both the development applicant... and the public official prior to submittal."

This chapter establishes Objective Design Standards that serve as minimum requirements for residential development in the City. Compliance with these standards will remove subjective or discretionary review of a proposed residential project. For any developer of a qualifying project seeking exceptions to these standards, or any of the City's applicable design guidelines, the City's existing discretionary design review process is available.

17.18.20 - Applicability

These standards are mandatory for any qualifying residential project that requests streamlined processing and ministerial approval pursuant to state law provisions that reference objective design standards. Qualifying residential projects are those that comply with Government Code Section 65913.4(a).

Section 65913.4(a)(2)(C) provides that Section 65913.4 applies to areas within a jurisdiction that is zoned for residential use or residential mixed-use development or has a general plan designation that allows residential use or a mix of residential and nonresidential uses, and at least two-thirds of the square footage of the development is designated for residential use. As such, these Objective Design Standards apply to developments meeting these requirements within the following zoning districts: R-1, R-2, R-3, C-1, C-2, and DT-MU. Section 65913.4(a)(1) defines a multifamily development as a development that contains two or more residential units.

17.18.30 - Objective Design Standards

- A. Site standards
 - 1. Street connectivity
 - a) External Connectivity. Streets within any proposed subdivision or development site shall be aligned with existing and planned streets in adjacent neighborhoods so as to create a continuous street pattern. All streets, alleys, and pedestrian pathways in any subdivision or development site shall connect to other streets and to existing and planned streets outside the proposed subdivision or development.

- b) Internal connectivity. New streets must form a continuous and linked vehicular and pedestrian network within the development.
- c) Cul-de-sacs and dead-end streets. Any cul-de-sac or other dead-end street longer than 300 feet shall be connected to other streets by a pedestrian path.
- d) No gates/barriers. Automobile and pedestrian access points into multi-family residential developments shall not be gated or closed off to the public.
- e) Block length/mid-block pedestrian connections. Blocks shall not exceed 600 feet in length, measured from street centerline to street centerline, unless mid-block pedestrian connections are provided at intervals of no more than 350 feet apart. Such pedestrian connections shall include a walkway at least 10 feet wide.
- 2. Parking required.
 - a) Pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4(e), no parking shall be required for those developments located within one-half mile of public transit.
 - b) Pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4(e), the maximum required parking shall be one (1) space per dwelling unit. A carport or enclosed garage is optional.
- 3. Parking location, design, and access.
 - a) All parking areas shall have adequate ingress and egress to and from a street or alley. Sufficient room for turning and maneuvering vehicles shall be provided on the site. Bumper rails or other barriers shall be provided where deemed necessary by the city to protect property.
 - b) Entrances and exits to parking lots and other parking facilities shall be provided at locations approved by the city engineer and planning director.
 - c) The parking area, aisles, and access drives shall be constructed with a minimum of six-inch base and a double chip and seal so as to provide a durable, dustless surface, and shall be graded and drained as to dispose of surface water, with the design and specification so such work is subject to the approval of the city engineer.
 - d) The use of cluster parking spaces into small parking areas, dispersed around the site, to avoid large paved expanses is required.
 - e) All parking lots shall include appropriately striped spaces for standard and compact cars as well as handicapped spaces.
 - f) No parking is allowed in setback areas along project boundaries.
 - g) A separation of pedestrian and automobile traffic paths is required to minimize conflict areas for safety.
 - h) Walkways to connect parking lots to building entrances shall be provided. Define walkways by landscaping, lighting and paving.
- 4. Parking lot lighting.
 - a) Light fixture design shall be compatible with the design and the use of the principal structure on the site. Light fixtures shall be equipped with appropriate reflectors and shielded to prevent illumination of the adjacent properties.

- b) Incorporate placement of light fixtures into the landscape scheme of the project. Show location and type of all exterior lights on the landscape plans.
- c) Height of any light poles shall be appropriate for the project and surrounding environment. Height of the light poles shall not exceed that of the main building.
- d) Use bollard type luminaries, maximum of eight feet high for pedestrian areas.
- e) Shield light sources to prevent any glare or direct illumination on public streets, adjacent properties, or highways.
- f) All area lights shall be energy efficient type (High Pressure Sodium or equivalent).
- g) All on-site pedestrian and automobile traffic areas shall be well lit for safety and security.
- 5. Onsite outdoor recreation areas.
 - a) On each multifamily development of five (5) units or more within any district, whether such development is on a single recorded lot or on two or more adjacent recorded lots, such development shall provide usable and accessible open space for the recreation and outdoor living enjoyment of the development's residents and their guests. Such open space shall not be less than twenty-five percent (25%) of the total parcel area.

Open space standards shall be as follows:

- i. 1.Open space may be provided in more than one location.
- ii. To qualify as required open space, such area shall have no area less than ten (10) square feet and at least fifty percent (50%) open to the sky and free of any overhead structural or architectural projections.
- iii. Open space shall be improved. Improvements may consist of planting areas containing living plant materials, walks, patios, swimming and wading pools, arbors, temporary and removable shade elements, recreation equipment and facilities and such other appurtenances as are appropriate to serve the outdoor living needs of people.
- iv. Garages, carports, open off-street parking areas, vehicular access driveways, trash enclosures, clothes- drying yards and non-landscaped areas shall not be included in calculating required open space.
- b) In addition to those standards in subdivision (a), any multifamily project of fifteen (15) or more units shall provide the following recreation area:
 - i. A defined and fenced play area which may include fixed play equipment, ball courts, swimming or wading pools and similar child play facilities,
 - ii. The play area shall not be less than five hundred (500) square feet, or twenty-five (25) square feet for each apartment unit, whichever is greater.
 - iii. Be visible from multiple dwelling units within the project.
 - iv. Be protected from any adjacent streets or parking lots with a fence or other barrier at least four feet in height.
- c) Exemptions. The play area requirement shall not apply to any development that is:

- i. Age-restricted to senior citizens; or
- ii. Located within 300 feet of a public park.
- d) For minimum setback requirements, refer to the zoning district.
- 6. Landscaping.
 - a) At a minimum, the following landscaping is required:
 - i. All areas not occupied by parking, driveways, pedestrian walkways, recreation areas, buildings, structures, and hardscape shall be landscaped.
 - ii. The required front yard shall be landscaped and not used for parking. The only area not landscaped within the required front yard is the driveway access to the required parking area, which shall not exceed twenty-five (25) feet in width,
 - Landscaping within the front setback area shall include one fifteen (15) gallon-sized tree for each fifty (50) feet of frontage, and at least one gallonsized shrub for each five feet of frontage,
 - iv. In addition to the required trees and shrubs, the landscaped area may also be planted with lawn or ground cover plants. Other decorative, non-plant ground covers may be used as long as they do not exceed twenty-five (25) percent of this landscaped area,
 - v. Parking lot landscaping shall be provided to enhance sites and building parking areas in compliance with the standards identified in Section 17.76.110 of this code.
 - vi. Where landscaping is provided, adequate irrigation and maintenance thereof shall be provided, including replacement of dead trees, shrubs, vines or other ground cover required pursuant to this section.
- 7. Fencing.
 - a) Any perimeter fencing utilized along a public street, shall be constructed of decorative iron, pre-painted welded steel, or wood picket material.
 - b) Fences and walls shall be compatible in style and material with the main structures on a site.
 - c) To avoid the monotony of long, solid walls and fences around the perimeter of projects, variation in height, and depth is encouraged.
 - d) Signs, lights, and other street furniture incorporated into the design of fences and walls are encouraged.
 - e) Barbed wire and chain link fencing is prohibited.
 - f) Fences and walls used for noise control shall be made of materials most suited for noise reduction, and which minimize reflective sound.
 - g) Security fencing and gates shall be of an open type to allow for maximum visibility of the secured area. Wrought iron and cast iron fences are recommended for security fences and gates for all uses.
 - h) Fencing shall be a maximum of six feet in height. Fencing over six feet in height, excepting subsection B above, shall require a building permit. All corner lots,

including corners on alleys, shall be a maximum of three feet in height within the front and exterior side yard setback areas.

- i) All fences shall be made of durable and weather-resistant materials as approved by the city.
- 8. Refuse containers.
 - a) Provide dumpsters for garbage recycling, and green waste containers collection within a screened enclosure design specifically for that use.
 - b) Shield all dumpsters within an enclosure a minimum of six feet tall. Allow adequate size to accommodate the needed dumpsters and recycling containers. All enclosures and gates should be detailed to withstand heavy use. Provide wheel stops or curbs to prevent dumpsters from banging into walls of enclosure.
 - c) Provide an opening so that pedestrians can access the dumpsters without opening the large gates.
 - d) Provide lighting at trash enclosures for nighttime security and use.
 - e) Locate dumpster enclosures so that no dwelling is closer than 20 feet (including those on abutting properties), or more than 100 feet from a residential unit. No minimum distance from dwellings is required if dumpsters are located within a fully enclosed room.
- B. Building design standards
 - 1. Building mass and articulation.
 - a) Building length. Buildings shall not be less than 20 feet or exceed 200 feet in width or length on any side.
 - b) Façade articulation. All building facades that face or will be visible from a public street shall include one or more of the following treatments.
 - i. Exterior building walls shall vary in depth through a pattern of offsets, recesses, or projections.
 - ii. The building height shall be varied so that a portion of the building has a noticeable change in height; or roof forms are varied over different portions of the building through changes in pitch, plane, and orientation.
 - iii. The building façades shall incorporate details such as window trim, window recesses, cornices, belt courses, and other design elements.
 - c) Maximum building height: 35 feet.
 - d) Vertical articulation for tall buildings. In buildings of three or more stories, upper and lower stories shall be distinguished by incorporating one or more of the following features. These features may be applied to the transitions between any floors, except where otherwise specified.
 - i. A change in façade materials, along with a change in plane at least one inch in depth at the transition between the two materials.
 - ii. A horizontal design feature such as a water table, belt course, or bellyband.
 - iii. A base treatment at the ground floor consisting of a material such as stone, concrete masonry, or other material distinct from the remainder of the

façade and projecting at least one inch from the wall surface of the remainder of the building.

- iv. Setting back the top floor(s) of the building at least five feet from the remainder of the façade.
- 2. Façade transparency/limitation on blank walls.
 - a) At least 20 percent of the area of each street-facing facade of a residential building must consist of windows, doors, or other openings. No wall that faces a sidewalk, pedestrian walkway, or publicly accessible outdoor space shall run in a continuous plane of more than 30 feet without a window, door, or other opening.
- 3. Roofline
 - a) Minimum roof slope: 3:12.
 - b) Minimum roof eave overhang, twelve (12) inches.
- 4. Exterior theme
 - a) Buildings shall carry the same theme on all elevations. For the purposes of this standard, a theme includes primary (non-accent) materials and colors.
 - b) Affordable units and market rate units in the same development shall be constructed of the same or similar exterior materials and details such that the units are not distinguishable.
- 5. Screening.
 - a) All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment shall be screened or incorporated into the design of buildings so as not to be visible from the street. Equipment to be screened includes, but is not limited to, all roof-mounted equipment, air conditioners, heaters, utility meters, cable equipment, telephone entry boxes, backflow preventions, irrigation control valves, electrical transformers, pull boxes, and all ducting for air conditioning, heating, and blower systems. Screening materials shall be consistent with the exterior colors and materials of the building.

- To:
 Office of Planning and Research PO Box 3044, 1400 Tenth Street, Room 212 Sacramento, CA 95812-3044
 From: (Public Agency) City of Orland

 Bit S Fourth Street Sacramento, CA 95812-3044
 Orland, CA 95963 (Address)
 - County Clerk
 County of <u>Glenn</u>
 <u>526 West Sycamore Street</u>
 Willows, CA 95988

Project Title: Amendment to Municipal Code for ADUs.

Project Location - Specific:

City of Orland - Citywide.

Project Location – City: Orland Project Location – County: Glenn

Description of Nature, Purpose, and Beneficiaries of Project: Amendment to Municipal Code incorporating Objective Design Standards.

Name of Public Agency Approving Project:

City of Orland

Name of Person or Agency Carrying Out Project:

City of Orland

Exempt Status: (check one)

- □ Ministerial (Sec. 21080(b)(1); 15268);
- □ Declared Emergency (Sec. 21080(b)(3); 15269(a));
- □ Emergency Project (Sec. 21080(b)(4); 15269(b)(c));
- Categorical Exemption. State type and section number: <u>§115061(b)(3) common sense rule</u>
- □ Statutory Exemptions. State code number:____

Reasons why project is exempt:

The City of Orland City Council has determined that this project is exempt from CEQA as it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the proposed revisions to the City of Orland Municipal Code would have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore, the project is exempt pursuant to CEQA Guidelines Section 15061(b)(3).

Lead Agency Contact Person: Scott Friend, AICP

Area Code/Telephone/Extension: (530) 865-1608

Signature:_____ Date: _____ Title: <u>City Planner</u> ■ Signed by Lead Agency

■ Signed by Lead Agency

Date received for filing at OPR: N/A

PLANNING COMMISSION RESOLUTION NO. 2022-XX

A RESOLUTION OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF ORLAND RECOMMENDING TO THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF ORLAND, APPROVAL OF THE ORLAND MUNICIPAL CODE AMENDMENT AND ASSOCIATED CEQA EXEMPTION TO ADOPT OBJECITVE DESIGN STANARDS FOR THE CITY OF ORLAND.

WHEREAS, On January 1, 2021, the State of California adopted revisions to Government Code Section 65913.4 requiring ministerial approval of qualifying multifamily developments; and

WHEREAS, adoption of revisions of Government Code Section 65913.4 by the State results in a necessary amendment to the City's Municipal Code to include Objective Design Standards; and

WHEREAS, the Planning Commission of the City of Orland, California held a duly noticed Public Hearing to consider the matter on February 17th, 2022, as provided by law; and

WHEREAS, *Title 17- Zoning* has been revised to include *Chapter 17.18 Objective Design Standards* as shown in **Exhibit A**; and

WHEREAS, following the advertisement of the matter in the newspaper of general circulation as required by the Orland Municipal Code and State Government Code, the Planning Commission held a duly noticed public hearing on the proposed amendments to Title 17, *Zoning,* in order to provide the community and interested parties the opportunity to comment on the proposed amendments; and

WHEREAS, The Planning Commission determined that the proposed Municipal Code Amendment is exempt from CEQA under Section 15061(b)(3), known as the "General Rule" or "Common Sense" exemption as the Commission finds that it can be seen with certainty that there is no possibility that the proposed revisions to the City of Orland Municipal Code would have a significant effect on the environment; and

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED, that the Planning Commission of the City of Orland does hereby recommend to the City Council of the City of Orland, approval of Ordinance <u>2022-XX</u> regarding the Orland Municipal Code Amendment and associated CEQA Exemption.

The foregoing resolution was passed and adopted at a regular adjourned meeting of the Orland Planning Commission held on **February 17th, 2022** by the following vote:

AYES: Commissioners

NOES: Commissioners

ABSENT OR NOT VOTING: Commissioners

Scott Friend, City Planner

CHAPTER 17.18 – OBJECTIVE DESIGN STANDARDS

Sections:

17.18.010 – Purpose.

California State Senate Bill 35 (Government Code Section 65913.4), which went into effect on January 1, 2018, requires the availability of a streamlined ministerial approval process for multifamily residential developments in jurisdictions that have not yet made sufficient progress toward meeting their regional housing need allocation (RHNA) as determined by the California Department of Housing and Community Development.

Included in the streamlining process, cities are required to establish objective design standards for multifamily residential development. SB 35 defines an objective design standard as one that involves "no personal or subjective judgment by a public official and is uniformly verifiable by reference to an external and uniform benchmark or criterion available and knowable by both the development applicant... and the public official prior to submittal."

This chapter establishes Objective Design Standards that serve as minimum requirements for residential development in the City. Compliance with these standards will remove subjective or discretionary review of a proposed residential project. For any developer of a qualifying project seeking exceptions to these standards, or any of the City's applicable design guidelines, the City's existing discretionary design review process is available.

17.18.20 - Applicability

These standards are mandatory for any qualifying residential project that requests streamlined processing and ministerial approval pursuant to state law provisions that reference objective design standards. Qualifying residential projects are those that comply with Government Code Section 65913.4(a).

Section 65913.4(a)(2)(C) provides that Section 65913.4 applies to areas within a jurisdiction that is zoned for residential use or residential mixed-use development or has a general plan designation that allows residential use or a mix of residential and nonresidential uses, and at least two-thirds of the square footage of the development is designated for residential use. As such, these Objective Design Standards apply to developments meeting these requirements within the following zoning districts: R-1, R-2, R-3, C-1, C-2, and DT-MU. Section 65913.4(a)(1) defines a multifamily development as a development that contains two or more residential units.

17.18.30 - Objective Design Standards

- A. Site standards
 - 1. Street connectivity
 - a) External Connectivity. Streets within any proposed subdivision or development

site shall be aligned with existing and planned streets in adjacent neighborhoods so as to create a continuous street pattern. All streets, alleys, and pedestrian pathways in any subdivision or development site shall connect to other streets and to existing and planned streets outside the proposed subdivision or development.

- b) Internal connectivity. New streets must form a continuous and linked vehicular and pedestrian network within the development.
- c) Cul-de-sacs and dead-end streets. Any cul-de-sac or other dead-end street longer than 300 feet shall be connected to other streets by a pedestrian path.
- d) No gates/barriers. Automobile and pedestrian access points into multi-family residential developments shall not be gated or closed off to the public.
- e) Block length/mid-block pedestrian connections. Blocks shall not exceed 600 feet in length, measured from street centerline to street centerline, unless mid-block pedestrian connections are provided at intervals of no more than 350 feet apart. Such pedestrian connections shall include a walkway at least 10 feet wide.
- 2. Parking required.
 - a) Pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4(e), no parking shall be required for those developments located within one-half mile of public transit.
 - b) Pursuant to Government Code Section 65913.4(e), the maximum required parking shall be one (1) space per dwelling unit. A carport or enclosed garage is optional.
- 3. Parking location, design, and access.
 - a) All parking areas shall have adequate ingress and egress to and from a street or alley. Sufficient room for turning and maneuvering vehicles shall be provided on the site. Bumper rails or other barriers shall be provided where deemed necessary by the city to protect property.
 - b) Entrances and exits to parking lots and other parking facilities shall be provided at locations approved by the city engineer and planning director.
 - c) The parking area, aisles, and access drives shall be constructed with a minimum of six-inch base and a double chip and seal so as to provide a durable, dustless surface, and shall be graded and drained as to dispose of surface water, with the design and specification so such work is subject to the approval of the city engineer.
 - d) The use of cluster parking spaces into small parking areas, dispersed around the site, to avoid large paved expanses is required.
 - e) All parking lots shall include appropriately striped spaces for standard and compact cars as well as handicapped spaces.
 - f) No parking is allowed in setback areas along project boundaries.
 - g) A separation of pedestrian and automobile traffic paths is required to minimize conflict areas for safety.
 - h) Walkways to connect parking lots to building entrances shall be provided. Define walkways by landscaping, lighting and paving.

- 4. Parking lot lighting.
 - a) Light fixture design shall be compatible with the design and the use of the principal structure on the site. Light fixtures shall be equipped with appropriate reflectors and shielded to prevent illumination of the adjacent properties.
 - b) Incorporate placement of light fixtures into the landscape scheme of the project. Show location and type of all exterior lights on the landscape plans.
 - c) Height of any light poles shall be appropriate for the project and surrounding environment. Height of the light poles shall not exceed that of the main building.
 - d) Use bollard type luminaries, maximum of eight feet high for pedestrian areas.
 - e) Shield light sources to prevent any glare or direct illumination on public streets, adjacent properties, or highways.
 - f) All area lights shall be energy efficient type (High Pressure Sodium or equivalent).
 - g) All on-site pedestrian and automobile traffic areas shall be well lit for safety and security.
- 5. Onsite outdoor recreation areas.
 - a) On each multifamily development of five (5) units or more within any district, whether such development is on a single recorded lot or on two or more adjacent recorded lots, such development shall provide usable and accessible open space for the recreation and outdoor living enjoyment of the development's residents and their guests. Such open space shall not be less than twenty-five percent (25%) of the total parcel area.

Open space standards shall be as follows:

- i. 1.Open space may be provided in more than one location.
- ii. To qualify as required open space, such area shall have no area less than ten (10) square feet and at least fifty percent (50%) open to the sky and free of any overhead structural or architectural projections.
- iii. Open space shall be improved. Improvements may consist of planting areas containing living plant materials, walks, patios, swimming and wading pools, arbors, temporary and removable shade elements, recreation equipment and facilities and such other appurtenances as are appropriate to serve the outdoor living needs of people.
- iv. Garages, carports, open off-street parking areas, vehicular access driveways, trash enclosures, clothes- drying yards and non-landscaped areas shall not be included in calculating required open space.
- b) In addition to those standards in subdivision (a), any multifamily project of fifteen (15) or more units shall provide the following recreation area:
 - i. A defined and fenced play area which may include fixed play equipment, ball courts, swimming or wading pools and similar child play facilities,
 - ii. The play area shall not be less than five hundred (500) square feet, or twenty-five (25) square feet for each apartment unit, whichever is greater.
 - iii. Be visible from multiple dwelling units within the project.

- iv. Be protected from any adjacent streets or parking lots with a fence or other barrier at least four feet in height.
- c) Exemptions. The play area requirement shall not apply to any development that is:
 - i. Age-restricted to senior citizens; or
 - ii. Located within 300 feet of a public park.
- d) For minimum setback requirements, refer to the zoning district.
- 6. Landscaping.
 - a) At a minimum, the following landscaping is required:
 - i. All areas not occupied by parking, driveways, pedestrian walkways, recreation areas, buildings, structures, and hardscape shall be landscaped.
 - ii. The required front yard shall be landscaped and not used for parking. The only area not landscaped within the required front yard is the driveway access to the required parking area, which shall not exceed twenty-five (25) feet in width,
 - Landscaping within the front setback area shall include one fifteen (15) gallon-sized tree for each fifty (50) feet of frontage, and at least one gallonsized shrub for each five feet of frontage,
 - iv. In addition to the required trees and shrubs, the landscaped area may also be planted with lawn or ground cover plants. Other decorative, non-plant ground covers may be used as long as they do not exceed twenty-five (25) percent of this landscaped area,
 - v. Parking lot landscaping shall be provided to enhance sites and building parking areas in compliance with the standards identified in Section 17.76.110 of this code.
 - vi. Where landscaping is provided, adequate irrigation and maintenance thereof shall be provided, including replacement of dead trees, shrubs, vines or other ground cover required pursuant to this section.
- 7. Fencing.
 - a) Any perimeter fencing utilized along a public street, shall be constructed of decorative iron, pre-painted welded steel, or wood picket material.
 - b) Fences and walls shall be compatible in style and material with the main structures on a site.
 - c) To avoid the monotony of long, solid walls and fences around the perimeter of projects, variation in height, and depth is encouraged.
 - d) Signs, lights, and other street furniture incorporated into the design of fences and walls are encouraged.
 - e) Barbed wire and chain link fencing is prohibited.
 - f) Fences and walls used for noise control shall be made of materials most suited for noise reduction, and which minimize reflective sound.

- g) Security fencing and gates shall be of an open type to allow for maximum visibility of the secured area. Wrought iron and cast iron fences are recommended for security fences and gates for all uses.
- h) Fencing shall be a maximum of six feet in height. Fencing over six feet in height, excepting subsection B above, shall require a building permit. All corner lots, including corners on alleys, shall be a maximum of three feet in height within the front and exterior side yard setback areas.
- i) All fences shall be made of durable and weather-resistant materials as approved by the city.
- 8. Refuse containers.
 - a) Provide dumpsters for garbage recycling, and green waste containers collection within a screened enclosure design specifically for that use.
 - b) Shield all dumpsters within an enclosure a minimum of six feet tall. Allow adequate size to accommodate the needed dumpsters and recycling containers. All enclosures and gates should be detailed to withstand heavy use. Provide wheel stops or curbs to prevent dumpsters from banging into walls of enclosure.
 - c) Provide an opening so that pedestrians can access the dumpsters without opening the large gates.
 - d) Provide lighting at trash enclosures for nighttime security and use.
 - e) Locate dumpster enclosures so that no dwelling is closer than 20 feet (including those on abutting properties), or more than 100 feet from a residential unit. No minimum distance from dwellings is required if dumpsters are located within a fully enclosed room.
- B. Building design standards
 - 1. Building mass and articulation.
 - a) Building length. Buildings shall not be less than 20 feet or exceed 200 feet in width or length on any side.
 - b) Façade articulation. All building facades that face or will be visible from a public street shall include one or more of the following treatments.
 - i. Exterior building walls shall vary in depth through a pattern of offsets, recesses, or projections.
 - ii. The building height shall be varied so that a portion of the building has a noticeable change in height; or roof forms are varied over different portions of the building through changes in pitch, plane, and orientation.
 - iii. The building façades shall incorporate details such as window trim, window recesses, cornices, belt courses, and other design elements.
 - c) Maximum building height: 35 feet.
 - d) Vertical articulation for tall buildings. In buildings of three or more stories, upper and lower stories shall be distinguished by incorporating one or more of the following features. These features may be applied to the transitions between any floors, except where otherwise specified.

- i. A change in façade materials, along with a change in plane at least one inch in depth at the transition between the two materials.
- ii. A horizontal design feature such as a water table, belt course, or bellyband.
- iii. A base treatment at the ground floor consisting of a material such as stone, concrete masonry, or other material distinct from the remainder of the façade and projecting at least one inch from the wall surface of the remainder of the building.
- iv. Setting back the top floor(s) of the building at least five feet from the remainder of the façade.
- 2. Façade transparency/limitation on blank walls.
 - a) At least 20 percent of the area of each street-facing facade of a residential building must consist of windows, doors, or other openings. No wall that faces a sidewalk, pedestrian walkway, or publicly accessible outdoor space shall run in a continuous plane of more than 30 feet without a window, door, or other opening.
- 3. Roofline
 - a) Minimum roof slope: 3:12.
 - b) Minimum roof eave overhang, twelve (12) inches.
- 4. Exterior theme
 - a) Buildings shall carry the same theme on all elevations. For the purposes of this standard, a theme includes primary (non-accent) materials and colors.
 - b) Affordable units and market rate units in the same development shall be constructed of the same or similar exterior materials and details such that the units are not distinguishable.
- 5. Screening.
 - a) All exterior mechanical and electrical equipment shall be screened or incorporated into the design of buildings so as not to be visible from the street. Equipment to be screened includes, but is not limited to, all roof-mounted equipment, air conditioners, heaters, utility meters, cable equipment, telephone entry boxes, backflow preventions, irrigation control valves, electrical transformers, pull boxes, and all ducting for air conditioning, heating, and blower systems. Screening materials shall be consistent with the exterior colors and materials of the building.